Developing markets as community hubs for inclusive economies: a best practice handbook for market operators

Myfanwy Taylor, Sara González, Paul Waley and Rosie Wilkinson
Authors and acknowledgements

Dr Myfanwy Taylor is an expert on urban economies and politics, including collaborative research with market traders, industrial firms and other small businesses. She is the main researcher in the Markets4People project.

Dr Sara González has 10 years of experience researching and publishing on traditional markets in the UK and internationally. She is the Principal Investigator of the Markets4People project.

Dr Paul Waley is an expert on cities and urban restructuring with a focus on East Asia but with a longstanding research interest in traditional retail markets in the UK. He is co-investigator in the Markets4People project.

Rosie Wilkinson has supported numerous research projects themed around culture and heritage. She is the research assistant in the Markets4People project.

Special thanks to the many research participants and collaborators that gave considerable time and knowledge to the Markets4People research project. Thank you to our co-investigators Lisa Buckner, Andy Newing and Graham Clarke from the University of Leeds, Frances Northrop from the New Economics Foundation, Sophie Watson from the Open University, Chris Savage, Shanaaz Carroll and Joe Harrison from NMTF and to handbook partners Suzanne Perry from Power to Change and Helen Power from CLES. Thanks also to Graham Wilson and David Preston from NABMA, and to members of our Steering Group.


Contact us:

✉️ markets4people@leeds.ac.uk
📞 +44 (0)113 34 33300
✉️ trmcommunityvalue.leeds.ac.uk/
🐦 @markets4people

© The Authors (2022)
DOI: http://doi.org/10.5518/100/75

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons (CC-BY 4.0)

The handbook was supported financially by the Economic and Social Research Council [grant number ES/P010547/1], the University of Leeds Impact Acceleration Account [award number 118631.053] and Power to Change.
## Contents

List of case studies ................................................................. 4  
Executive summary ................................................................. 5  
1. Introduction ....................................................................... 7  
2. Value the community benefits of TRMs ............................. 8  
3. Connect TRMs with other local authority goals and responsibilities ........................................... 16  
4. Partner with other organisations to deliver community value projects ........................................ 21  
5. Deliver inclusive redevelopment schemes .......................... 28  
Appendix ............................................................................... 41  
References ............................................................................ 42
List of case studies

1. Alexandra Rose Charity (Rose Vouchers)
2. Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council (Barnsley Markets)
4. Bradford Council (Darley Street Market)
5. Bury Council (Bury Market)
6. Calderdale Council
7. East Cambs Trading Co (Ely Markets)
8. Freeman Street Market, Grimsby
9. Hackney Council, London (Ridley Road Market)
11. Islington Council, London (Chapel Market)
12. Kirklees Council (Queensgate Market)
13. Leeds City Council (Kirkgate Market)
14. Levenshulme Market CIC
15. Mendip Borough District Council
16. Naturally North Coast and Glens, Northern Ireland
17. Newcastle City Council (Grainger Market)
18. Newham Council, London (Queen’s Market)
19. Sheffield City Council (Moor Market)
20. Warrington Borough Council (Warrington Market)
21. Wyre Borough Council (Fleetwood Market)
Executive summary

This best practice handbook is a practical guide for market operators on how to operate and develop traditional retail markets (TRMs) as community hubs for inclusive economies. Concerns about the gentrification of TRMs have increased in the UK in recent years, prompting many market operators to seek out advice and examples of how to avoid, minimise or balance it. This handbook provides a starting point for any market operator interested in pursuing an inclusive, community-oriented and holistic approach to operating and developing TRMs, drawing together a wide-range of innovative case studies from across the UK.

The handbook is an output of the 3.5 year Markets4People research project, a collaboration between researchers from the University of Leeds and the Open University, NMTF (the organisation representing market traders in the UK) and the New Economics Foundation. Building on the previous work of NMTF and NABMA (the organisation representing market operators in the UK), the project aimed to generate new tools, evidence and proposals for understanding and enhancing the community value of TRMs in the UK. Through a survey of 1,500 users of exemplary UK TRMs, the Markets4People project produced powerful quantitative evidence of the community value TRMs deliver for their customers, in particular for low-income and other marginalised or vulnerable groups. 50 interviews, 20 follow-up discussions and six workshops (see Appendix) then enabled the project to identify and explore some of the ways in which market operators were already innovating to enhance the community value of TRMs. While some of these examples are already promoted by the key market sector organisations NMTF and NABMA, this handbook brings them together for the first time as part of a broader approach and agenda for operating and developing TRMs as community hubs for inclusive economies. This approach supports and enhances TRMs’ wide-ranging roles and functions, contributing to an inclusive and community-oriented recovery of high streets, town centres and local economies from the Covid-19 pandemic, as well as many other local authority policy areas and responsibilities.

The handbook offers an alternative to previous approaches to developing TRMs, which have been informed by twin narratives of decline and gentrification. On the one hand, TRMs have been framed as retail spaces from a bygone era managed by financially struggling local authorities who no longer see much purpose for them. On the other, they have been reframed and redeveloped as trendy, food and leisure destinations for young and professional customers to attract footfall and vibrancy to town centres and high streets. In the process, existing traders and customers can often be marginalised as rents become higher and markets change their atmosphere and offer. This is a problem because the customer base of TRMs includes groups of people already suffering from isolation or multiple vulnerabilities who rely on markets for affordable provisioning and opportunities for social interaction. Although these twin narratives of decline and gentrification are extremes and most markets fall somewhere in between, the tension between the two has been present in most discussions about the future of TRMs in recent years amongst operators, traders and community groups.

This handbook provides a new and freely accessible resource for any market operator looking to pursue an inclusive, community-oriented and holistic approach to operating and developing TRMs while avoiding gentrification. It is aimed primarily at local authorities, which operate 82% of markets in the UK, but will also be relevant to private operators (10%) and markets operated by cooperatives, social enterprises and community interest companies (8%). The handbook will be useful not only for markets teams but also other teams working on the wider suite of local authority goals and responsibilities to which TRMs contribute, including Covid-19 recovery, high streets, economic development, public health, food policy, climate change and social inclusion. While its main focus is on TRMs, which provide a relatively low-cost and wide-ranging offering to predominately low-income communities, it will also be relevant to farmers and specialist markets seeking to develop their community value and serve low-income communities.
The handbook proposes four key ways in which local authorities can operate and develop markets as community hubs for inclusive economies:

1. **Value the community benefits of TRMs**
   - Use market-specific methods and tools
   - Draw on wider methods for measuring social value
   - Learn from the insights of market traders, users and other groups

2. **Connect TRMs with other local authority goals and responsibilities**
   - Make a holistic business case for investment
   - Develop broad Key Performance Indicators
   - Embed officers from other key departments in the Markets team
   - Set up a cross-council markets forum
   - Deliver council services from TRMs

3. **Partner with other organisations to deliver community value projects**
   - Partner with schools and colleges to engage students in markets
   - Partner with universities on teaching and research linked to markets
   - Connect with employment and training providers
   - Offer space to and collaborate with third sector organisations

4. **Deliver inclusive redevelopment schemes**
   - Seek long-term community benefits from investment
   - Make regular, incremental and sensitive improvements
   - Offer opportunities and support to all current traders
   - Minimise disruption for existing traders
   - Ensure trader mix policies reflect community value
   - Collaborate with trader and user groups
   - Monitor the inclusivity of redevelopment schemes
1. Introduction

Traditional Retail Markets (TRMs) provide a wide range of relatively low-cost food, other goods and services to predominately low-income communities. The term ‘traditional’ is used in the UK to distinguish these markets from farmers and specialist markets whose offering is generally aimed at higher-income communities. There is no single definition of the community value of TRMs: markets all have their local particularities and vary across the whole of the country. However, broadly speaking, community value refers to markets’ social benefits and cultural functions, as well as their more socially-oriented economic roles. The community benefits of TRMs therefore typically include:

- Serving low-income and other marginalised, vulnerable or discriminated-against groups, for example older people, migrants and Black and Minoritised communities;
- Providing affordable and quality produce, including fresh and healthy food;
- Supporting social and cultural interaction, and being inclusive and generally accessible places;
- Providing low-cost and accessible trading spaces, sustaining employment and livelihoods for traders; and
- Generating economic value through customers’ purchases, rental income for market operators and increased footfall in high streets and town centres.

This list can be expanded to include TRMs’ environmental benefits, for example reduced carbon emissions through active travel, use of public transport and reduced food miles; reduced waste; and circular economy initiatives. These factors, however, were not a major focus of the Markets4People project.

The community value of TRMs makes them ideally suited to serve as community hubs for inclusive economies. This approach to operating and developing TRMs makes clear their potential to contribute to several interrelated policy agendas, in particular Covid-19 recovery, high streets and local economic development amongst others. More specifically, this approach emphasises the opportunities TRMs offer to advance an inclusive, community-oriented and sustainable approach to these and other key contemporary policy agendas. For example, while markets have been highlighted as a solution for struggling high streets and a route to local economic recovery post-Covid, the emphasis has not been on TRMs but rather on markets that appeal to younger, more affluent consumers and which focus on leisure and experiential consumption. Operating and developing TRMs as community hubs for inclusive economies suggests a shift in policy focus away from these more elite consumption spaces towards markets which serve low-income groups, provide affordable food and other staples, etc. The many innovative new and emerging examples highlighted across the four sections of this handbook demonstrate the lively interest in this agenda at a local level.
2. Value the community benefits of TRMs

In order to operate TRMs as community hubs for inclusive economies, market operators need to understand and value their community benefits. This will involve investing in regular research and engagement, something which may be particularly challenging for local authorities struggling with the impacts of austerity. However, as this handbook shows, developing an evidence base for the community benefits and value of TRMs can open up new opportunities for collaboration and new funding and investment. A separate Markets4People report on measuring the value of markets contains more information on many of the methods discussed in this section.10

2.1 Use market-specific methods for measuring economic and social value

Market operators should ensure they and/or their consultants have expertise in methods and tools for measuring social value. This includes the growing number of methods for measuring economic and/or social value designed specifically for use in markets (Table 1; Figures 1 and 2). Most methods require data collection, for example surveys with market users and traders. Some methods can be carried out in-house by market operators themselves, using specially-designed templates. Other methods are more suited to use by consultants with specialist expertise in measuring social value as well as retail/consumer research. Using pre-existing tools and templates can considerably reduce the cost of undertaking or commissioning customer research, as well as generate findings which can be compared and benchmarked with other markets via existing industry networks such as NABMA and APSE.

Figure 1: Selected social value measures from the GLA’s social value toolkit

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Number of traders participating in Healthy Food vouchers schemes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Number of traders participating in Healthy Food vouchers schemes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Number of traders from marginalised or vulnerable groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Number of traders providing specialist products and services for specific communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Number of bookings of market stalls for community events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Number of market users from equalities groups benefiting from specific interventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METHOD</td>
<td>DESCRIPTION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Economic performance template<sup>11</sup> | Templates developed for the National Association of British Market Authorities (NABMA) for calculating market turnover through three triangulated methods, based on total customer spend, total trader turnover, and rental income. | Free  
Designed to be used by market operators themselves.  
Standardised method which can generate comparable data and is supported and promoted by NABMA. | Focuses only on economic measures, in particular turnover. |
| Performance network for market operations<sup>12</sup> | A tool and network for benchmarking the performance of participating local authority market services against one another over time. One of the Association of Public Service Excellence’s (APSE) wider suite of local authority performance networks. | Linked to a performance network which offers opportunities for local authority market operators to learn from one another.  
Standardised method which can generate comparable data for local authority market services. | Only relevant for local authority market operators.  
Only available to NABMA and APSE members.  
Strong focus on generic measures of local authority efficiency.  
Market-specific measures have a narrow financial focus. |
| Social value toolkit<sup>13</sup> | A process and framework of indicators for identifying, measuring and communicating the social value and impact of market projects, including those funded by the Mayor of London’s Good Growth fund. | Free  
Relatively simple.  
Standardised framework and set of indicators to select from (see Figure 1).  
 Particularly useful for making a business case for investment. | Focuses on specific projects in markets, rather than markets themselves.  
Strongly informed by the priorities of the Good Growth fund; may require tailoring for other funders. |
| Markets4People user survey<sup>14</sup> | A 15-min face-to-face user survey focusing on demographic information, shopping and eating at the market and the social and cultural life of the market. | Free  
Includes economic, social and cultural benefits.  
Produces quantitative evidence (see Figure 2).  
Provides a user perspective. | Requires some prior knowledge of the main user groups in order to be representative (e.g. in terms of age, gender and ethnicity).  
A new independent survey, not currently linked to wider benchmarking and performance management networks in the sector. |
| Survey underpinning the GLA’s High Streets for All report<sup>15</sup> | A trader and user survey designed to reveal the social value of high streets, also relevant for markets. | Free  
Relatively short.  
Provides a trader and user perspective. | |
Figure 2: Key statistics from the Markets4People user survey conducted at Bury Market in 2019:

- **98%** of market users say it provides access to affordable quality food.
- **74%** of market users bump into people they know at the market.
- **81%** have interacted with traders from different ethnic or cultural backgrounds.
- **53%** of all market users are aged 60 or above.
- **74%** of Bury Market users said that the Market was their main reason for visiting the town centre.
- **99%** think that Bury Market is an open and welcoming space for all.
- Only **16%** of customers want to see changes at Bury Market.
East Cambs Trading Co (ECTC) – an arms-length trading company set up by Ely Council to run various council services, including markets – has commissioned research on the economic and community benefits of Ely Markets. ECTC took this step as a response to concerns raised by local businesses that the Market negatively impacted on their businesses. ECTC was therefore particularly keen to demonstrate the footfall and benefit the Market brought to surrounding businesses and the town centre as a whole, but also to demonstrate its community benefits in order to cement the place of the market in the community. The research found that Ely Markets bring increased footfall, local market consumer spending and further spending in local high street shops to the value of £14.9m per annum. It also revealed the importance of Ely Markets as places to connect with people and a focus for artistic, cultural and community events. The research has changed the attitude of local businesses to Ely Markets; they now see the positive benefits it brings to them and the wider local economy. The research has also demonstrated to local councillors the importance of Ely Markets beyond the financial income generated, and informed a wider strategy to place the markets at the heart of the community.

Bury Council’s Markets Service conducted face-to-face surveys of customers and traders every other year from 2003 to 2014. Both customers and traders were surveyed, with a sample size of 280 customers. The survey was conducted in order to:

- Obtain regular data on a whole range of issues, including demographic data on visitors, customer satisfaction and areas for improvement, from both trader and customer perspectives.
- Inform strategies for promoting and improving the market. For example, gathering data about where customers were coming from enabled the Council to target its marketing effectively.
- Make the case for investment, for example a new toilet block and funding to employ an apprentice to enhance the Market’s online presence.
- Raise the profile of the Market within the Council: a two page summary of the survey findings was sent to local councillors and officers.

Unfortunately, council funding for surveys was withdrawn after 2014. However, the Markets4People user survey was undertaken in Bury Market in 2019, generating up-to-date data about who uses the Market and the economic, social and cultural benefits they derive from it (Figure 2). Bury Council used this evidence to make the case for £20m investment in Bury Market (plus £5m from the Council) as part of a successful bid to the UK Government’s Levelling Up Fund. More specifically, evidence that the Market is particularly well used by low-income and other vulnerable groups was important in showing how investment will benefit these communities.

In 2020, Newham Council secured a £2m contribution from the Mayor of London’s Good Growth fund for a £5m programme of improvements to Queen’s Market and the immediate surrounding area (see also Section 5). The £70m Good Growth programme aims ‘to empower people, to make better places and to grow prosperity’ in London by funding regeneration projects. Local authorities bidding for funding are required to identify and deliver long-term outcomes around the central Good Growth fund themes of people, places and prosperity. One of the four main elements of Newham Council’s application was a series of upgrade improvements to Queen’s Market, including new lighting, flooring and toilets. Selecting from a designated list of core Good Growth measures, the Council identified that these improvements would result in a wide range of economic and social outcomes including an increase in footfall; increase in visitor satisfaction; new jobs created and existing jobs safeguarded; and a sense of belonging. The application also drew on some of the available evidence for Queen’s Market’s current economic and social value to make the case for investment, including from the Markets4People research project and an earlier piece of research by the New Economics Foundation.
2.2 Draw on wider methods for measuring social value

Market operators and their consultants can also draw on wider methods and tools for measuring social value (Table 2). These methods are commonly used by charities and social and community enterprises, for example to demonstrate their public benefit to the Charities Commission, to evidence their social value/impact for funders or to inform the development of the organisation. There is considerable scope for market operators to draw on these wider methods in order to drive innovation across the UK markets sector more generally.

Table 2: Wider methods for measuring social value

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>METHOD</th>
<th>WHAT IS IT?</th>
<th>STRENGTHS</th>
<th>LIMITATIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local Multiplier 3</td>
<td>A tool for measuring the local retention of money flows. Surveys with local businesses and their supply chains track how money is spent and re-spent.</td>
<td>Communicates the benefit of shopping in markets for the local economy. Can be used to encourage traders to make changes in supply chains to increase local retention.</td>
<td>Time consuming and complex to calculate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Return on Investment (SROI)</td>
<td>A method for assigning a financial value to social outcomes. Enables a cost-benefit analysis to weigh the costs of investment against the benefits produced.</td>
<td>Government-recommended method for measuring social value. Can generate trusted data to justify public investment. Involves significant stakeholder engagement.</td>
<td>Requires significant data collection and availability of suitable financial proxies. Resource-intensive. The financial cost of some social benefits may be a poor proxy for their broader societal value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Impact Assessment</td>
<td>A participatory, bottom-up approach to identifying the potential impacts of an intervention, and exploring possible alternatives.</td>
<td>Social impact indicators are defined by affected communities themselves. Can be empowering for participating communities.</td>
<td>Requires resources. Requires genuine collaboration between local authorities and affected communities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As one of the world’s most famous and successful food markets, Borough Market collects extensive customer data to inform the operation of the Market. It is also a charitable trust, which means it must report annually on its public benefit to the Charities Commission. The overarching charitable objectives of the Trust are to provide a market as ‘a public amenity for the benefit of the public and the relief of rates for the benefit of the inhabitants of the Parish of St Saviours, Southwark’. While footfall is one of the main indicators used by the Trust to measure the success of Borough Market, it also assesses its performance as a resource for the local community. The Trust reports to the Charities Commission on a range of initiatives including cooking workshops, a project to support start-up businesses, the Young Marketeers programme for local school children and a food waste recycling scheme, Plan Zheros.

Evidence of public benefit is also used by Borough Market to object to development proposals which could threaten the functioning of the Market.

SROI was used by Naturally North Coast and Glens (NNCG), a trader-led not-for-profit social enterprise, to evidence the value of the artisan markets it operates in the Causeway Coast and Glens region of Northern Ireland. NNCG started life in 2012 as Ballycastle Town Market, an initiative of the local Chamber of Commerce to boost tourism and the local economy after the 2007/8 global financial crisis. When the Chamber of Commerce could no longer continue
running the market, traders began to run it themselves. In 2015, traders formed a Community Interest Company and gained nearly £100k funding from the Coastal Communities Fund, enabling them to hire staff, equipment and vehicles and to develop training programmes for traders and local people. In 2019, NNCG commissioned SROI expert Melanie Brown to evidence the benefits and value produced by their markets. She produced an Outcomes Framework, informed by a Theory of Change developed with the NNCG and key stakeholders defining the specific benefits the market delivered to different stakeholder groups. The Framework specified an indicator to measure each impact, and how its monetary value would be determined through collection of financial data or use of financial proxies from HACT’s nationally recognised Social Value Bank. These proxies are robustly calculated using data from large national datasets, in particular the British Household Panel Survey. Figure 3 lists some of the financial proxies used to measure the SROI produced by NNCG’s markets. By adding together the monetary value of all benefits across all stakeholder groups, the research identified a social return on investment of £19 for every £1 invested in NNCG markets across Ballycastle.

**Figure 3: Selected financial proxies used to measure the Social Return on Investment produced by Naturally North Coast and Glen’s markets**

- £1,663 per trader, General Training For Job. Social Value Bank, 2019
- £14,344 per trader, High Confidence. Social Value Bank, 2019
- £2,170 per trader, Able to Obtain Advice Locally. Social Value Bank, 2019
- £4,301 per local resident who attended the market, Feel Belonging to Neighbourhood. Social Value Bank, 2019
- £519 per local resident who attended the market, Engaging (as an audience member) in a cultural activity. Department for Culture, Media and Sport, 2019

Early on in its development, Levenshulme Market CIC commissioned an expert in social entrepreneurship to conduct a review of the social value it created. The aim was to make the case for further investment from funders and to guide decisions about where and how to invest future profits. The research took a participatory social accounting approach, focusing on specific aspects of social value identified by key stakeholders. Information was collected about what had been achieved thus far, using pre-existing data as well as interviews, focus groups and surveys. Quantitative figures were generated for economic measures such as the number of jobs, average turnover per trader and local investment. In this case, suitable financial proxies for social and community benefits were not identified, limiting the ability of the research to value these aspects. Nonetheless, the research identified the importance of these aspects and made recommendations for how to improve them. The research process itself also produced benefits by bringing market traders, users and others together to build dialogue, share knowledge and shape the future of Levenshulme Market. Further information is contained in an earlier Markets4People report on measuring the value of TRMs.
2.3 Learn from the insights of market traders, users and local groups

Traders and users have a close knowledge of working and shopping at markets, which market operators can learn from through regular meetings and informal discussions. Engaging with local community groups can also help market operators to gain a better understanding of the communities served by specific markets, and to understand the market in relation to the wider community and neighbourhood from these groups’ perspectives. Market operators should make a particular effort to engage with marginalised, vulnerable or ‘hard-to-reach’ groups whose views and experiences might otherwise be overlooked. Market operators can partner with relevant groups and organisations well placed to run workshops, creative projects and other activities with these groups to ensure their perspectives are included. Discussions with market traders, users and other groups can also open up new possibilities for collaboration, including those explored in the rest of this handbook.

The Alexandra Rose Charity (ARC) ran participatory workshops with young mothers to shape its own ‘Rose Voucher’ scheme to enable low-income families to access fruit and veg. The scheme partners with local children’s centres, who identify parents living on low-incomes and with young children who could benefit from the scheme. They receive Rose Vouchers which can be spent on fresh fruit and vegetables at specific locations. Feedback from workshop participants was crucial in identifying suitable locations for redeeming the vouchers in the initial design of the scheme. While in the US food voucher schemes focus on farmers markets, in the UK workshop participants said they didn’t shop at farmers markets because they were too far away and too expensive. ARC focused instead on traditional and street markets, which were more popular amongst workshop participants.

ARC also used participatory workshops to evaluate the impact of the Rose Vouchers scheme in the London Borough of Lambeth. Participatory workshops created an informal and supportive environment in which Rose Voucher users could openly discuss issues. The workshops produced quantitative and qualitative data evidencing changes in voucher users’ shopping and eating habits. Approximately 90% of adults and children said they were eating more fruit and vegetables since claiming Rose Vouchers. The Alexandra Rose Charity used this evidence to demonstrate impact to partners and funders in order to further expand the programme. A new programme of research is currently underway to demonstrate the wide-ranging benefits of the Rose Vouchers scheme.

Rose Vouchers (Liz Finlayson/Vervate Alexandra Rose Charity)
In Bradford, the Council’s Markets team has taken up a number of opportunities to partner and engage with community and grassroots groups. For example, when a local group, Bradford Senior Power, was looking for rent-free premises, the Markets team offered them an empty unit rent free. This was a win-win situation, in which the group secured rent-free premises while the Council filled a vacant unit and were able to engage directly with the older people involved in the group’s activities. The Council was able to speak with Bradford Senior Power about how older people travel to the market, making the market dementia friendly and new seating and toilet facilities.

The Markets service also used its marketing and promotion budget to make a small grant to WUR Bradford, a local grassroots artists’ collective. WUR Bradford undertook a series of activities in the market, including a theatre piece, installations and other live performances celebrating the importance of the market, including a series of poems by 16-year-old Haris Ahmed. WUR Bradford’s activities demonstrated the community functions of the market alongside its role as a retail space, as well as generating a lot of publicity, interest and footfall from a very small grant. These initiatives were not planned as part of a wider strategy, but rather were opportunities which emerged organically and were supported by the Markets service.

Discussions with traders and local groups led to new collaborations at Freeman Street Market in Grimsby, owned and operated as a charity by the Enrolled Freemen of Grimsby. By the late 2000s, occupancy levels had declined to 60% and the market was suffering from a lack of investment. A member of the team carried out research on the Market to inform improvement plans as part of a Masters in Business Administration they were undertaking at the time at nearby Hull University. Interviews with market traders carried out as part of the research were important in re-establishing dialogue and trust between the market operator and traders, enabling improvements to market stalls to be designed and delivered successfully. Interviews with local community groups, social enterprises and education providers found their objectives were closely aligned with those of the Market, establishing a basis for collaborations and partnerships. Over the years, a number of organisations and groups operated from the Market in order to deliver services and support to low-income and other marginalised groups.
3. Connect TRMs with other local authority goals and responsibilities

Operating TRMs as community hubs for inclusive economies opens up opportunities to contribute to a range of local authority policy areas and responsibilities, including for example the future of high streets, town centre development, Covid-19 recovery, economic development, public health, social inclusion, community cohesion, food and environment. This section provides practical advice and examples of how market operators can embed these wider policy agendas in markets.

3.1 Make a holistic business case for investment

Increasingly, market operators have to apply for funding to improve their markets. Identifying and evidencing TRMs’ broad contributions across several policy areas can make a much stronger business case for investment. Markets teams can commission research and studies on the roles and functions of the specific markets they operate, using the tools and resources outlined in Section 2. They can also draw on wider evidence for markets’ economic, social and cultural benefits, as demonstrated through the Markets4People project and other research. This evidence can be used to show how investing in TRMs can contribute to town centre regeneration and public health, for example. Including social and cultural benefits as well as financial and economic benefits will help to make a stronger business case for investment from councils themselves as well as external funders.

An early evaluation of Alexandra Rose Charity’s first Rose Vouchers project (see also Sections 2.3 and 4.3) at Ridley Road Market in Hackney, east London, found that it produced a wide range of benefits, including increased fruit and vegetable intake for adults and children. Feedback from voucher users included that fruit and vegetables at the Market were better value and quality than at supermarkets. Presented with this evidence, the Charity’s Trustees decided to proceed with and expand the Rose Vouchers project. Evidence from the Ridley Road project also led to the Charity being commissioned by Lambeth Council to run a project at Brixton and West Norwood markets, supported by funding from the Mayor of London. The evaluation of the Lambeth project found that around 90% of adults and children were eating more fruit and vegetables due to claiming Rose Vouchers, while the project was driving a wider increase in shopping at Brixton and West Norwood markets for 94% of participants, as well as generating a host of other benefits to health and well-being including enjoying the social atmosphere of markets and the rapport with traders. This evidence contributed to the Charity’s success in securing a development grant from the Big Lottery to expand the project to Barnsley and Liverpool, as well as securing funding to develop a digital platform for Rose Vouchers. This investment and growth enabled the Charity to reach the major milestone of one million Rose Vouchers issued in October 2021.

3.2 Develop broad Key Performance Indicators

KPIs are the key measures through which the performance of council services and senior council staff are assessed and play a major role in determining how local authorities use their limited funds. KPIs for local authority market teams can be very narrow, however, focusing on metrics relating to the effective financial management of markets as a source of rental income for local authorities (e.g. total income; total operating costs; vacancy rates) as well as the core duties and responsibilities of market operators (e.g. ensuring regulatory compliance). Developing a wider suite of KPIs can help to broaden the focus of the markets service towards its broader functions. Where local authorities are undertaking improvement or redevelopment projects in markets, indicators of inclusive market redevelopment can also be incorporated to monitor performance (see Section 5.7).
Calderdale Council’s Markets Service has developed a ‘balanced scorecard’ for measuring its performance. This balanced scorecard is embedded in the business plan for the Markets Service and therefore provides the overarching framework for its work. There are four main elements of the balanced scorecard, focusing on 1) growing the economy; 2) customer service; 3) human resources; and 4) costs. KPIs for growing the economy, for example, include the number of businesses lost as well as the number of businesses supported and created. KPIs for customer service include the number of trader meetings and consultation surveys undertaken as well as the number of complaints and compliments received. These indicators help to ensure the Markets Service remains focused on supporting existing traders as well as attracting new ones, and on maintaining a dialogue with market traders and users and addressing their complaints. Work is now beginning to further develop this balanced scorecard to demonstrate how the Markets Service contributes to the three key themes of Calderdale Council’s new strategic vision – distinctiveness; kindness and resilience; and talented and enterprising.

3.3 Embed officers from other key departments in the markets team

One way to connect TRMs with a specific policy area is to embed local authority officers from that particular area in the Markets team, thus bridging the governance fragmentation that often exists in local authorities. Seconded staff can help the markets to quickly gain new relevant knowledge and make wider connections to those new policy areas, which can be easily shared amongst the wider Markets team. Embedding staff from other teams can be particularly useful when a local authority wants to develop a new markets strategy which contributes directly to that policy area.

At Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council, public health officers were placed in teams to embed public health priorities across the breadth of the Council’s work following the transfer of responsibilities for public health from the NHS to local authorities in 2013. Public health is a major priority for the Council, in light of relatively poor health outcomes for people living in Barnsley. By embedding a public health officer in the Markets team, the Council has been able to explore and develop opportunities for markets to contribute to all six of its public health priorities, including smoking cessation and children’s oral health. A major early focus was making Barnsley markets smoke-free zones, including phasing out the sale of smoking products. Barnsley Council was also an early adopter of the Rose Vouchers scheme. In the first two years of the project, over 280 families used the fruit and veg vouchers worth £3 per child per week (double if a child is under one), bringing in over £35,000 to Barnsley Market. The Council’s market, town centre and public health teams also worked closely together to secure ‘Purple Flag’ status for Barnsley as part of a voluntary international accreditation programme focusing on creating safe night time town centres. This includes market traders in the new Market Kitchen delivered through the redevelopment of Barnsley Market - part of the wider ‘Glass Works’ town centre scheme, discussed in detail in Section 5 – putting in place a range of measures to promote responsible drinking and local drug and alcohol support services. During the Covid-19 pandemic, two pop-up vaccination clinics were located at Barnsley Market, because of the opportunities it offered to engage older people and ethnic minority communities in a safe and familiar setting. Both clinics delivered above their targets. The market and town centre teams also worked closely with public health colleagues to support market traders and other local businesses in trading safely. More recently, the Council has begun work with local and regional NHS organisations to develop a new Community Diagnostics Centre at the ‘Glass Works’ site funded via a national capital funding programme to support service recovery from the Covid-19 pandemic.
3.4 Set up a cross-council markets forum

A cross-council markets forum would typically include senior officials from the markets service and other relevant local authority departments and teams sitting together regularly to discuss how the market connects and can benefit other council services and vice versa. This can address problems related to fragmented governance, where responsibilities for different aspects of a market and related issues are split across a number of different council departments. In some cases, a cross-council approach to markets can be led by councillors, through a dedicated markets group. Cross-council markets forums can also include trader and user groups, and other key partners and stakeholders, as part of a more collaborative approach to managing markets, as discussed in Sections 4 and 5. A cross-council markets forum would be well placed to oversee the development of a market management and improvement strategy designed to maximise markets’ contributions to the full breadth of a local authority’s goals and responsibilities.

In 2019, Newham Council set up the Queen’s Market Cross-Departmental Working Group to coordinate across the council on matters relating to the management and maintenance of Queen’s Market. The initiative came as a response to several issues of governance fragmentation and frustration from key stakeholders that the Council’s Regeneration Team (now the ‘Community Wealth Building’ team) found when they began a piece of work around long term improvements for the Market. To address the issue, the Regeneration team brought the relevant teams together in order to discuss and tackle specific current issues in the Market. The Working Group now meets monthly and includes as its regular members senior officers from the council’s Community Wealth Building, Street Enforcement, Parking, Highways and Street Lighting teams alongside the Markets Service and Property Services team. Officers from other teams – for example, Community Neighbourhoods – are invited to attend when relevant issues are discussed. The Working Group is accountable to the relevant Corporate Directors, and reports when needed to the Councillors with responsibility for the relevant portfolios. Newham Council officers report that the Working Group has helped with coordination, providing an efficient mechanism for bringing people together and focusing efforts on solving specific problems. It has helped specific teams to gain an understanding of each other’s perspectives and constraints and facilitated the development of a more collaborative and collective approach in which the different teams assist one another to solve problems. A ‘tracker’ spreadsheet is used to track progress on the issues each month, helping to speed things up and identify and resolve any blockages. The Working Group has also been helpful in ensuring continuity where individual members of staff leave or change jobs.

Calderdale Council currently has two cross-council markets fora, which it is looking to expand and extend. The Cabinet Markets Working Party is a cross-party group appointed by the Cabinet to oversee Calderdale markets. It generally meets every six weeks. Senior officials from the relevant teams, including the markets service, corporate assets, business and skills, communications, and finance, reporting to the Working Party. It was set up in 2005, as part of a suite of changes and measures introduced following a 2001 Audit Commission report which highlighted a number of problems with the markets service at the time. Since then, the Cabinet Markets Working Party has led a £5m investment programme, including delivering the UK’s first solar-powered market at Sowerby Bridge, spending £3m on the Halifax Borough Market, £0.5m on Todmorden Market and taking over a market from the private sector, improving its occupancy rates by 60%. In addition, Calderdale Council operates an officer-level group to coordinate on Borough Market, its largest market. This group also meets every six weeks, and includes officers from the council’s markets service, business and skills, visitor economy, arts and culture, finance and communications teams, as well as the local Business Improvement District (BID). The Markets Service intends to replicate this approach for other Calderdale markets and to include trader groups.
3.5 Deliver council services from TRMs

Local authority market operators can also explore options for delivering key council services at TRMs. TRMs’ customer base often includes many groups which local authorities are particularly keen to reach through their various services, for example people living on low incomes, older people, migrants and ethnic minority groups. These customer groups include people who may be unable to access or feel uncomfortable accessing council services in their main locations, for example due to lack of time, accessibility issues or feeling unwelcome. Yet these ‘hard-to-reach’ groups may have the most to gain from accessing council services. A number of local authorities have therefore begun to experiment with delivering council services such as library services, advice and support services, employment, skills and training services, and public health campaigns.

The Community and Library Hub in Kirkgate Market, Leeds (Leeds City Council)

In 2019, Leeds City Council set up a new Community and Library Hub in Kirkgate Market in Leeds city centre following from an earlier initiative that eventually dwindled due to lack of funds. Several years later, the idea for a library hub in the Market resurfaced when the Market Manager contacted the council’s library service to explore how to open up access to online business advice and support for traders at Kirkgate Market. The idea of a library hub at Kirkgate Market fitted well with the Council’s library strategy to reach out to communities following the closure of a number of its library hubs, and the need to focus its resources on locations to reach as many priority users as possible. Kirkgate Market was an ideal location because of its large customer base, including many of these key target audiences. A new library hub also fitted well with the Council’s markets strategy to serve a wide range of communities, including people living on a range of incomes, as well as providing market traders with access to online business advice and support. The Markets Service also seized the opportunity to move its information centre to the new library hub, providing it with a more central, visible and accessible location. The new hub has not only opened up access to library and markets services for users and trader (attracting new library members) but also generated new opportunities for collaboration between the library and markets teams. Hub staff receive dual training from both the library and
markets teams, so that they can assist with all enquiries. The Communications and Events Manager for the Markets Service is based in the hub, and the library and markets teams regularly collaborate and jointly promote events and activities. For example, families attending library activities receive a free meal voucher to spend in the Market. The libraries service also promote the Market through their communications with schools, and join in with events in the Market.

In 2017, Newcastle City Council’s Adult Social Care team began running dementia awareness activities and projects in Grainger Market. For the first two years, the activities were focused around Dementia Awareness Week. Then, recognising the potential of Grainger Market to engage with key groups (the Market is well used by older people\(^{44}\)), the Adult Social Care team began to explore the longer-term potential of the Market to contribute to the Council’s ambition to make Newcastle-upon-Tyne a Dementia Friendly City. In 2019, additional funding from a one-off grant from elected members enabled the Adult Social Care team to cover the cost of the business rates due on a unit in the Market for an initial 12-month period. Before the Covid-19 pandemic, the Adult Social Care team engaged between 50 and 60 people a week in activities relating to dementia at Grainger Market. Market trader as well as customers engaged with the activities, seeking advice for themselves or on behalf of customers, friends or family members. In total around 42 organisations expressed interest in running activities from the Grainger Market dementia awareness unit.

A wide range of initiatives have been organised so far, including:

1. Information and support for carers.
2. Physiotherapy services.
3. Outreach sessions from hospital dementia nurses.
4. Awareness raising around the Dementia Safeguarding Scheme (Herbert Protocol).
5. A blood pressure testing programme administered by pharmacy students from the University of Newcastle.
6. Replacement of rubber stoppers on walking sticks.
7. The Home Alone theatre and installation piece about loneliness amongst older people.\(^{45}\)
8. Help and advice for traders to adjust their shop fronts, signage and approach for customers with dementia as part of the Slow Shopping initiative.

These activities resonated with the broader long-term practice of the Council’s on-site market management team of bringing in community groups and charities into Grainger Market. The Grainger Market dementia awareness project has also inspired other similar projects in community and shopping spaces as part of the Dementia Friendly City programme. It has also opened up a broader conversation between the Council’s Adult Social Care team and the University of Newcastle about how the Council and the University can partner to provide students with experience and knowledge of community health issues whilst contributing to Council policy priorities. At the time of writing, discussions are underway within the Council about the potential for longer-term funding for the Grainger Market dementia awareness project.
4. Partner with other organisations to deliver community value projects

Partnering with other organisations can be an effective way to enhance markets’ community value for existing user groups, attract new user groups and deliver wider benefits to the local community. Local authorities can partner with schools and colleges, universities, Jobcentre Plus and third-sector organisations including charities, community groups and social enterprises, which will often be well-placed to engage specific communities. Local authorities can also participate in national initiatives such as NMTF’s Young Traders Market and NABMA’s Love Your Local Market. Such partnerships build on the cross-council approach described in the previous section, further extending the contribution of TRMs to wide-ranging local authority goals such as public health and local economic development.

4.1 Partner with schools and colleges to engage students in markets

The wide-ranging roles and benefits of markets offer many opportunities for market operators to work in partnership with schools and colleges. Building on the role of markets as a source of healthy and affordable fresh food, many market operators and traders already host school trips and provide resources to primary school children learning about healthy eating and where foods come from. Markets are also a popular location for events and activities for families, especially in school holidays, offering children entertainment as well as opportunities to learn about food and cooking. A number of market operators have also established specific initiatives with schools and colleges, providing opportunities to gain new skills and experience in the food and catering sector as well as in starting up and running your own small business more generally. There is considerable potential to expand these initiatives across cities and towns.

Calderdale Council’s Markets Service has partnered with local primary and secondary schools on a number of specific initiatives in recent years. In one example, the Markets Service joined up with other Council departments including Children and Young People, Regeneration, Customer Services and Communications to run the Calderdale Apprentice project, modelled on The Apprentice reality TV show. The project was part of a broader collaboration between the Children and Young People’s service and Calderdale secondary schools to develop enterprise education for Key Stage 4. The Calderdale Apprentice project involved 11 students from eight secondary schools undergoing training and assessment in key business skills, before forming teams to develop a brand and product to sell at a market stall at Halifax’s Borough Market. Feedback from participating students on the skills and experience they gained was very positive, and the project also generated positive local press coverage. Although the project costs were relatively low (approximately £2,000), unfortunately no further funding was available to continue the project.

The Markets Service has also developed a leaflet for schools (Markets and Schools) outlining various possibilities for collaboration, including:

1. Free access to market stalls for schools to run educational activities for children and parents.
2. Free tours of historic markets.
3. The potential for schools to run farmers markets and makers markets.
4. Links between markets and the national curriculum.
5. Links with other relevant initiatives such as Enterprise Week and Healthy Eating Week.

The Markets Service aims to further explore how markets can contribute to the national curriculum and to build this into its business plan. Additional staffing and resources would support the Markets Service in developing this agenda in collaboration with schools and other relevant council departments.
Kirklees Council’s Markets Service has developed a strong partnership with Kirklees College over recent years. The initial impetus for the partnership was to try to recruit and develop new traders into markets. While some new traders were recruited, the focus for the partnership has shifted towards the broader added value markets can bring to students’ learning and development, as well as encouraging them to use and visit markets. Business and Enterprise students at Kirklees College are able to try out new business ideas and learn skills and gain experience by trading from market stalls in Dewsbury and Huddersfield Markets. One member of the Markets team leads on this work, going into the College to help students prepare to trade on markets. The partnership with the College has also become an important route for the Markets Service to engage young people in redevelopment plans for Dewsbury Market and the wider town centre. Council staff believe working with Kirklees College has already helped them to bring more young people into the Market, as well as helping to ensure the new Market will be attractive to young people. NMTF supported this initiative by providing information and sessions to students on enterprise development as well as markets as a career option.

4.2 Partner with universities on teaching and research linked to markets

The breadth of universities’ teaching and research agenda offers up varied opportunities for collaboration on markets. TRMs’ wide-ranging roles and functions make them relevant to a wide-range of disciplines, including public health, food, environmental sustainability, urban planning and development, retail, business studies, social policy, sociology, geography, art and architecture. Markets can be integrated into diverse student learning programmes, for example by providing a specific site for applied or practice-based teaching and learning, a focus for student individual or group projects or a case study for inclusion in teaching materials. Markets can also make excellent sites for research on a wide range of topics, generating insights, ideas and projects of direct benefit to local authorities and market operators as well as academic findings. Partnering with universities on specific teaching and research projects can also attract students and other new customers to TRMs.
Leeds City Council’s Markets Service has a number of projects and initiatives linked to Leeds Kirkgate Market underway with local universities. The Markets team initially focused on attracting university students to the Market by advertising at freshers fairs and at student accommodation blocks. Later on, a marketing expert on the Management Board for Kirkgate Market set up a meeting between the Markets Service and one of their academic contacts from Leeds University Business School (LUBS). At the time, LUBS was looking for businesses to provide research projects for groups of 1st and 2nd year business and marketing students to undertake as part of their studies. The Management Board therefore identified a set of relevant and useful research projects linked to the strategy for Leeds Kirkgate Market which could be undertaken by students. Another academic at LUBS then approached the Markets Service to set up individual Masters-level research projects linked to the Market. The Markets Service report that these collaborations require significant time and investment, for example attending the university to brief groups of students on the projects available, meeting weekly with groups of students as they work on their projects, contributing to assessment of student work and writing job references for students. It is therefore important to ensure research projects meet a specific need. In this case, student research projects have directly informed the strategy for Kirkgate Market. Projects have included exploring how market traders can promote themselves and serve Chinese students, and how they can adapt to changes in retail habits linked to the Covid-19 pandemic. Projects have also led to other beneficial outcomes, including the Council learning from international students about markets in other countries, market traders having the opportunity to present to a meeting of the University’s China Forum and students securing job offers linked to the skills and experience gained. The Markets Service therefore see their partnership with the University not as a means to secure free research but rather as part of markets’ broader roles and functions in serving the local community.

Temporary Contemporary is a collaborative ‘live action research project’ between the University of Huddersfield and Kirklees Council’s Creative and Cultural Development and Markets teams. The project emerged from the Rotor art project which aimed (amongst other things) to expand access to the arts amongst local communities. At a meeting between the School of Arts and Humanities at University of Huddersfield and Kirklees Council, in which Queensgate Market in Huddersfield was identified as a great space to bring this together. For academics at the School of Arts and Humanities, the project provided an opportunity to explore a grounded and place-based approach to cultural production involving students, academic staff and the wider local community of arts and cultural practitioners. For the Council’s Creative and Cultural Development team, the project fitted well with its focus on supporting and developing cultural production as a driver of local economic development and using empty retail units on high streets. For the Council’s Markets Service, the project represented a welcome opportunity to fill some of the increasing number of vacant units at Queensgate Market specifically.

The project received initial seed funding from the School of Art, match-funded by Kirklees Council which also provided empty units for free and covered the cost of fit out. The project is led by a working group involving representatives of the Council’s culture and markets teams and the School of Arts at the University of Huddersfield. The cultural programme is developed by all parties, and curated by the School of Art. The Council’s Creative and Cultural Development team is responsible for the project’s day-to-day activities.

The project began in 2018 and, in the first year, three spaces were developed to exhibit work by students, staff and local artists in the Market. After this, the project expanded into empty shops in the Piazza shopping centre linked to the Market, involving 16 local cultural organisations and groups including the West Yorkshire Print Workshop and the Children’s Art School. After its initial focus on the Market and Piazza, the Temporary Contemporary project expanded
further to include other temporary spaces in Huddersfield via the Hello Huddersfield platform hosted by the Huddersfield Business Improvement District.

The Temporary Contemporary initiative has benefited both the University and the Council. The project has also been submitted by the School of Art as an ‘impact case study’ to the assessment process determining future research funding in UK higher education. The School of Art has committed to continuing to fund and support the project as part of its wider activities. For the Markets team, the project has helped to ensure the survival of Queensgate Market and to keep the space active. It was awarded Innovation of the Year at the Blachere Illumination Market Awards 2018 by NABMA. Temporary Contemporary will also play a role in the new 10 year vision for Huddersfield, The Huddersfield Blueprint. This vision includes new and improved cultural facilities in the Queensgate area as well as the redevelopment and amalgamation of Queensgate Market with Huddersfield Open Market into a single Huddersfield New Market. As this work progresses, it will be important that existing traders and users are included and benefit from the redevelopment (Section 5).

4.3 Connect with employment and training providers

Market operators can also promote market trading as a route out of unemployment and a career choice by working with Job Centre Plus and local training providers. The NMTF has partnered with job centres to support market traders so that they can offer work experience placements to young jobseekers, including supporting them to develop a job description and managing the recruitment process. Market operators can in turn encourage and support traders to participate in the scheme. Operators can also participate in NMTF’s Young Traders Market initiative which offers young people opportunities to try out market trading through growing and highly successful local, regional and national competitions, or host a Teenage Market event. Other market operators are developing their own schemes with local employment and training providers

Hackney Council’s Trading Places programme offers local jobseekers support to start trading on street markets in the borough. New traders pay a heavily discounted pitch fee for the first six months and are able to access skills and training courses in topics such as accounting, business management, marketing and employment law. The project connects with the DWP / Jobcentre Plus New Enterprise Allowance, which provides jobseekers with mentoring, a weekly allowance and access to start-up loans to assist in starting their own business. Skills and training courses are delivered by various retail companies and organisations recruited to the project by the Council. The Markets Service report that the scheme has been highly successful, contributing to a 25% increase in local traders on street markets in Hackney. The project has also helped to increase the total income received in pitch fees.

4.4 Offer space and collaborate with third-sector organisations

Many market operators offer free space to charities, community groups, social enterprises, arts groups and other not-for-profit organisations, including market stalls/pitches and use of events spaces. While many market operators already do this on an ad-hoc basis, there are opportunities for local authorities to develop more strategic partnerships with relevant groups and organisations linked to their broader goals and responsibilities. TRMs are often an attractive location for the groups to access and deliver services or projects to their key user or target groups. Providing free space in TRMs to third sector groups is one way in which local authorities can contribute to and support their activities and the wider benefits they bring. It can also help to liven up TRMs, especially those with vacant units, attracting new customers and increasing turnover for traders. Market operators can encourage the flow of benefits to traders by providing vouchers to spend in the market or asking organisations to source goods and services from within the market wherever possible. Going further, local authorities can collaborate with third sector organisations on specific community value projects and initiatives.
In April 2017, Newcastle City Council began letting a Grainger Market unit free of charge to Newcastle West End Foodbank. The West End Foodbank started in 2013 and provides emergency food assistance to over 50,000 people annually. A free unit at Grainger Market provided an ideal setting for the Foodbank to advertise its services to the public, functioning both as a drop-off point for people to make donations and to gain access to support from the Foodbank. Newcastle United Football Club (NUFC) Supporters Foodbank fundraises and collects donations for the West End Foodbank; the Market provided a physical location for fans and others to drop-off donations outside of matches and the football season. The Grainger Market site has also been used as a place to sell a clothing range developed by Toonaid in aid of the West End Foodbank, and to put on exhibitions and activities, including a live theatre performance based on an oral history project undertaken with Foodbank users. The NUFC Supporters Foodbank estimate that during the first 18 months, around 16 tonnes of food donations were collected at the Grainger Market unit, worth around £32,000, plus financial donations of around £10,000. The Grainger Market Foodbank hub has received strong support from the market traders and Newcastle City Council. While the Council and Grainger Market continue to support the Foodbank, sadly the Council no longer provides a free unit.

Seven local authorities currently partner with the Alexandra Rose Charity (ARC) to deliver Rose Vouchers in markets -- Barnsley, Glasgow, Hackney, Hammersmith & Fulham, Lambeth, Liverpool and Southwark. Already mentioned in Sections 2 and 3, the Rose Vouchers scheme provides families with young children vouchers to spend on fruit and vegetables, with the aim of promoting healthy eating and reducing food poverty. ARC report that they are usually approached by local authority children’s services or public health departments which generally provide the required funding contribution to the cost of the Rose Vouchers and participation in the scheme. Once a project starts and ARC begin to build relationships with the local authority Markets Service, they are quick to see the value and relevance of the scheme. The involvement of the Markets Service is essential in securing the support and involvement of market traders, in particular making sure they are equipped to accept Rose Vouchers electronically and promoting their participation in the scheme to customers. In the most successful cases, the local authority market team works together with other relevant departments such as children’s services and public health to jointly run the project. ARC plan to grow the Rose Vouchers scheme over the next five years to include more local authorities. Interested councils need to be able to make a contribution to the financial cost of the vouchers, and to commit staff time to support the implementation and take-up of the project. ARC also ask participating local authorities to support market traders in setting themselves up to accept NHS ‘Healthy Start’ vouchers. Healthy Start vouchers are worth £4.25 a week to eligible pregnant people and those with children under the age of four in England, Wales and Northern Ireland (a separate scheme exists in Scotland), and can be spent on milk, fruit, vegetables and pulses.
**Calderdale Council** has partnered with Cargodale CIC (a zero carbon e-cargo bike delivery service, based in Todmorden Market Hall) and Totally Locally (a campaign to support and encourage local independent businesses launched in Calderdale in 2010) to set up the DeliverHX delivery service. The project was initially set up with Covid-19 funding to support people isolating at home during the pandemic but has since been expanded to a regular delivery service. DeliverHX now provides free zero carbon e-bike delivery of goods bought online from Halifax Borough Market and selected independent shops in the town centre within central Halifax (HX1) and the surrounding area. Customers can purchase goods from multiple traders and businesses within the Market and town centre, which are then delivered in one go by Cargodale. The project is supporting traders within Halifax Borough Market to get online and join the scheme, and will be rolled out to all Calderdale Markets.

**Mendip Borough District Council** has provided market stalls free of charge to charities and local groups for many years. Recently, the Council formalised this approach in its markets strategy through the new ‘Charity and Local Community Group Market Pitches Policy’. This Policy is seen as part of the Council’s wider commitment to ensuring access to services, support, opportunities, secure lives and involvement in the community for all residents. Groups and organisations that have benefited from this policy include local literary groups, theatre groups, wildlife groups, food banks and bike jumble sales as well as road safety campaigns, police drop ins, hospitals, ambulances and bus services. Each week, a local school for pupils with complex and severe learning needs, Critchill School, has a free pitch at Frome Market, which they use to run a coffee and snack van, staffed by pupils who gain skills and experience as well as gaining access to the market and its community. Critchill School report that working on the catering van at Frome Market builds students’ self-esteem, confidence and communication, developing skills for life and work. Prior to the Covid-19 pandemic, a community group ran a stall at a market each week, selling books and toys to fund a lunch club for older people every Sunday. In another example, when the high street banks closed their branches in the area, mobile banks were able to come onto markets free of charge, opening up access to banking to the community. Opportunities are also taken to link markets to wider Council initiatives, for example hosting a bike jumble sale during Bike to Work week. The Markets Service is only required to be cost neutral, creating flexibility to deliver wider community benefits by opening up markets in this way. The Markets team sits within the Council’s Neighbourhood Services department, which is responsible for play areas, parks and community events, amongst other things. This positioning is a good fit for the team’s focus on involving and delivering benefits to the community through its markets. Other initiatives include hosting the first South West regional final for the NMTF Young Traders Market competition in 2019 and again in 2021, alongside working with the Wells Chamber of Commerce to introduce a new Market Trader of the Year award category to the Mendip Business Awards, acknowledging the importance of market trading as a business model.
In 2008, Wyre Borough Council partnered with the Citizens Advice Bureau (CAB) to set up a digital access hub in Fleetwood Market. At the time the CAB was looking for premises locally, while the Council was thinking of ways to support market traders to sell online. The idea of a digital access hub also fitted with the Council’s wider aim of attracting the local community to use Fleetwood Market, a successful tourist attraction for visitors from nearby Blackpool and the Lake District. Funding from the Council’s markets’ budget was therefore used to fit out a unit for the CAB, which they were able to use rent-free for the first few years. The Fleetwood Market digital access hub was a success for both the CAB and the Council; there was a lot of interest from market traders in improving their IT skills and starting to sell online. More generally, being able to access support within the Market was a positive for both traders and customers. While the project was sadly impacted by Covid-19, the digital access hub successfully reopened in November 2021 in an expanded space. The success of the initiative is such that the CAB will now pay a small rent to the Council.
5. Deliver inclusive redevelopment schemes

In order to develop and operate TRMs as community hubs for inclusive economies, operators need to take an inclusive approach to improvement and redevelopment schemes. These schemes can often result in gentrification of TRMs as existing traders and customers are excluded or marginalised within a redeveloped market designed to appeal to new, younger and more affluent customers. Such changes undermine TRMs’ capacity to deliver wide-ranging community benefits to low-income and other marginalised communities into the future. Local authorities wishing to develop and operate TRMs as community hubs for inclusive economies will therefore need to take a more inclusive approach to improving and redeveloping markets. While the specific approach will differ from market to market, this section outlines some key elements for all local authority market operators to consider putting in place at an early stage.

5.1 Seek long-term community benefits from investment

Local authorities should seek long-term community benefits from investing in TRMs, rather than a short-term financial return. TRMs produce wide-ranging economic, social and cultural benefits, contributing to many different local authority policy areas and responsibilities, for example town centre regeneration and public health. Local authorities can use these wide-ranging benefits and contributions to make a strong business case for reinvesting in markets any surplus generated by the markets service, as well as other sources of council and external funding. Where no financial surplus is generated, evidence of wider economic, social and cultural value can be used to make the case for further support and investment.

Retaining the surplus can increase the budget for routine maintenance, repairs and improvements, preventing more significant and potentially expensive problems building up over time. Part of the surplus can also be retained in a reserve fund, to be built up over the years to pay for substantial one-off repairs or improvements. Improvement and redevelopment schemes which deliver wide-ranging community benefits may be relevant to central government programmes (most recently the Future High Streets Fund and the Levelling Up Fund, for example) and third-sector funding bodies (e.g. Architectural Heritage Fund; National Lottery Heritage Fund), especially where they involve partnership with third sector organisations. Securing additional external funding can help to reduce the pressure on constrained council budgets and limit the need for councils to use prudential borrowing to fund improvements.

Where local authorities do borrow to fund improvements, they should not plan to recoup all or part of this investment by increasing the rental income from the market. Requiring a short-term financial return from investing in TRMs generates pressure to increase rent levels, which can displace existing traders and threaten the viability of the market or re-orientate the market towards higher-income customers. Increasing rents after redevelopment can be particularly damaging when traders’ businesses are already impacted by reduced footfall during a lengthy redevelopment process or following a change of location. If traders leave a market in significant numbers, this can undermine the success of the new or redeveloped market as a whole, negatively impacting other traders’ businesses and setting off a cycle of decline. It is therefore important to keep rents affordable to existing traders to ensure the market survives the disruption of redevelopment in the short term, and remains affordable for people on low-incomes in the long term. In the case that a market scheme is part of a wider project, local authorities should look to recoup any necessary costs from other more commercially-orientated elements of the wider project rather than from the market itself.

Sheffield City Council originally intended to recoup the cost of developing the new Moor Market through its rental income. Rents were set significantly higher than in the old city centre Castle Market, in anticipation of high footfall at the new location. Units were also fitted out to high specifications, requiring traders to pay a high service charge which the council projected would be affordable based on strong footfall in the new location. With the new rent levels, it was predicted that the new Moor Market would generate around £100k rather than the £70k generated by Castle Market, covering the costs of running the Market, repaying the debt and generating a small surplus for reinvestment. Just 65% of the traders initially moved from the old Castle Market to the new Moor Market when it opened in 2015, however. Occupancy rates in the Moor Market fell further as footfall failed to reach the projected levels of 100k per week, stabilising at around 50-60k per week. In 2016, Sheffield City Council took the decision to reduce rents by 50% in order to address the decline in the Market. Although traders continue to find the service charge too high, occupancy
rates have improved and stabilised at around 72%. While the Moor Market is not generating sufficient financial income to repay the cost of the development, research commissioned by the City Council evidences the Market’s wider economic benefits and contribution. For example, Sheffield’s markets support 400 jobs and generate £22 in direct, indirect and induced spending for every £1 spent in markets. This research – as well as the political commitment to markets in Sheffield – contributed to the City Council’s decision to commit additional revenue funding to repay the capital investment in the Moor Market.

Warrington Borough Council’s £142m town centre redevelopment project, Times Square, includes a new indoor market to replace the old 1974 market hall, as well as a cinema, leisure centre, restaurants and new public realm. The Council used prudential borrowing to finance the redevelopment, to be paid back through the rental income received from the new cinema and other commercial units as well as savings resulting from the consolidation of council office locations as part of the redevelopment. This means the new Warrington Market is not required to contribute to the cost of repaying the loans; it is only required to generate an income sufficient to cover its operating costs. Rents are charged at 15% of turnover for units in the new Cookhouse food court, which can be separated off from the main indoor market and opens five days a week until 7pm and two days until 11pm. The Cookhouse generates around two thirds of the total income for the market, with the remaining one third coming from the rest of the market. Here, rent levels are set in order to cover the remaining operating cost of running the market, and have remained more or less the same as they were in the old 1974 market hall. The Council also aimed to ensure as many traders from the old market as possible were included in the new development (section 5.3). Together, these decisions will help to ensure that the new market retains and includes traders serving people on low incomes so that it remains a market for all of Warrington.

In 2003, Bradford Council decided to reinvest 100% of the surplus generated by the Markets Service back into improving Bradford markets. This decision reflected the cross-party political support for and the importance of markets in the Bradford district. Since then, the markets’ annual surplus of £400k has been retained by the Markets Service and transferred into a dedicated Market Reserve Fund for future reinvestment in market capital projects. Senior market officers in the Markets Service determine how and when these monies are used and prioritised. In 2017, the Council announced plans to construct a new market in Bradford city centre, replacing the Oastler and Kirkgate Markets, with the aim of safeguarding the future of markets in Bradford city centre. The markets’ accrued annual trading surpluses were redirected towards the funding of the £26m Darley Street project alongside £15m of Council corporate funding, supplemented more recently with a further £3m from the West Yorkshire Combined Authority’s allocation under the national Government’s Getting Building Fund. The Council proposes to meet any funding gap through prudential borrowing with the annual borrowing costs met directly from the markets’ annual trading surplus. Reinvesting the Market Reserve Fund has significantly reduced the potential borrowing on this project, in turn reducing the pressure to generate additional income from the scheme to repay loans. The Council is not seeking a narrow financial return on its investment but rather aims to generate wider economic benefits by redeveloping the town centre. The Council is in the process of setting rent levels at the time of writing, but is committed to ensuring they are affordable for traders. Keeping rents affordable is seen as the main mechanism through which the Council can ensure the new Darley Street market continues to serve low-income communities while also including a new fresh and street food offering designed to attract higher income customers.
Newham Council has commissioned a bespoke ‘Social and Economic Appraisal Framework’ to guide its assessment of investment options for Queen’s Market and a neighbouring sheltered housing block, Hamara Ghar, discussed in more detail later in this section. This Appraisal Framework will integrate policy goals and indicators from key overarching Council strategies, in particular Newham’s Covid-19 recovery and community wealth building strategies. These strategies identify residents’ health, well-being and happiness as the Council’s central measures of success and require that the benefits of investment should be shared ‘locally, fairly and democratically’.\(^{64}\) The Council states that it is ‘not taking the “business as usual” approach to investment as it will consider social, civic and economic factors to help inform future decision making’.\(^{65}\) This work is at an early stage at the time of writing, making it impossible to assess the outcomes of this approach in any detail. Nonetheless, the Council has taken a first step towards an inclusive approach to investment at Queen’s Market by embedding key strategic social goals from the start.

### 5.2 Make regular, incremental and sensitive improvements

Our case study research on three exemplary TRMs found that the majority of users do not want to see radical changes to the market or its offer.\(^{66}\) Rather, market users want to see improvements to basic services and infrastructure, such as improved toilets, cleaning and repairs. This can make TRMs more attractive for existing and new customers, boosting footfall and turnover for traders and the market as a whole, without changing the market offer. Investing proactively in maintaining and upgrading the market environment will avoid a backlog of repairs building up, helping to retain market traders and users and avoiding the need for disruptive major redevelopment schemes. A programme of regular maintenance and incremental improvement is less likely to displace existing market traders and users, ensuring all can benefit from investment.

As well as investing in the market environment, local authority market operators can make sensitive interventions designed to enhance TRMs’ social and cultural functions. This might involve providing benches and seating for people to rest, central meeting points for people to gather and small flexible spaces for community events and activities. These interventions can be designed sensitively around places where people already gather and meet as well as around naturally occurring vacancies, minimising the need to displace current traders. Market operators can also offer vacant units to charities and community groups, or convert them into community facilities such as libraries or advice hubs, as outlined in Section 4.

Bury Council’s Markets Service retains an annual maintenance budget of around £100k from the £1m surplus Bury Market generates for Bury Council each year.\(^{67}\) This relatively modest budget has enabled the Council to undertake a programme of some repairs and maintenance over the years. This maintenance budget has contributed to the sound management of Bury Market by the Markets Service over the years, and its long-term success. The Market is Bury’s main attraction, one of the country’s best-known markets, and it regularly wins national awards. In 2021, the Council made a successful application to the national government’s Levelling Up Fund for £20m additional capital investment in the Market. The funding will be used to make essential improvements to the market environment, build a new flexible hall providing space for a wide range of community, cultural and business activities, and make public realm improvements and new programming. As the scheme progresses, specific measures will need to be introduced to ensure it meets the Council’s stated aim to ‘safeguard the existing strengths and current customer base of Bury Market, whilst widening the appeal to all residents in the borough’.\(^{68}\) The ideas and examples contained in this handbook – in particular in this section – will provide a useful starting point for shaping a suitable package of measures.

Calderdale Council’s Market Service does not currently retain the surplus generated by its markets for reinvestment. However, the Council’s corporate asset team has a strong record on investing in its prime heritage buildings. The Council is working its way through a programme of repairs and refurbishment of the Grade 2 listed Borough Market in Halifax town centre, with recent investments including £400k on refurbishing the heating, lighting and circulation systems and £750k on the roof. In 2021, the Council secured nearly £6m funding from the national government’s Future High Street Fund, which will be used to make further necessary basic repairs and improvements to the building. In parallel, the Markets Service is making a number of sensitive interventions within the market itself. For example, a small flexible space was created for community events and activities by consolidating a number of vacant units.
over several years. This space has enabled Borough Market to host local literary and music events and one-off themed markets. Plans are also underway to enhance the social space around the historic clock in the centre of the Market which serves as a natural meeting point, by introducing new seating (people say, 'I'll meet you under the clock'). These sensitive and incremental interventions work with the natural processes of change in Borough Market, reducing the disruption for traders and customers.

Queen’s Market, Newham (Saif Osmani)

Following an initial consultation in 2020-21, Newham Council decided not to progress further with major redevelopment options for Queen’s Market, preferring instead to explore options which retain, refurbish, modernise and add to the existing buildings. This decision reflected the Council’s desire to continue in its recent efforts to address the historic disinvestment in Queen’s Market through a more proactive maintenance programme in addition to the one-off basic improvements being delivered through the £5m Good Growth project (see also Section 2). Rather than throw away this recent investment and undertake a lengthy and disruptive major redevelopment scheme, the Council decided to first establish the viability of retaining and improving the existing Market building. The Council identified the benefits of this option as maximising the benefit of existing investment, being quicker to deliver improvements, retaining embodied carbon, and avoiding costly disruption for market traders and users. Major redevelopment options will only be explored if studies conclude that refurbishment and modernisation options are not viable or do not deliver enough benefits or if substantive site constraints are encountered.
Chapel Market is a historic London street market in Angel, which has continued to serve local working class communities even as Islington has gentrified. The adjacent area includes a number of council housing estates and neighbourhoods with high levels of deprivation. Over time, the number of vacancies at the Market has grown, leaving just 45 of 100 pitches regularly occupied. In 2019, Islington Council commissioned design proposals and a market strategy from architectural designers Unit 38 and NEF Consulting to address the decline in occupancy at Chapel Market, a twin commission that was innovative in linking ‘hard’ and ‘soft’ interventions. The proposals aimed to retain and celebrate the Market’s traditional working class role, ensuring it remains an affordable and social resource for local people and delivering new opportunities for employment, training, enterprise and collaboration, informed by the Council’s inclusive economy and community wealth building goals.

The physical design interventions proposed by Unit 38 included repair, cleaning and other core improvements to the street market and stalls; improvements to the market entrances; and a new flexible public square providing seating and equipment for community events and activities. A new ‘traders hub’ was also proposed, combining storage, facilities, low-cost workspace and inclusive economy programmes such as support for local young people to become market traders. Empty pitches would be consolidated to free up space for the new entrances at either end of the street, and the new public square and trader hub would be located on currently disused/underused spaces. The new Chapel Market strategy developed by NEF Consulting included additional proposals to make pitches available to Islington Council’s Learning, Skills and Employment services; offer pitches to local young people, building on the success of Arsenal Football Club’s community stall, run by participants in a Saturday job scheme offered by the Council’s employment service, iWork; work with traders to offer paid work experience to local young people; and develop a ‘pitch up and learn the trade’ scheme offering pitches for free for an initial six month period. New roles were proposed to manage the market and commercial space within the traders hub and to develop partnerships with local community and business groups. The development of the design proposals and market strategy was itself envisaged as a process of co-design and collaboration with market traders, local business and community organisations, generating networks and partnerships contributing to the project goals.

In 2021, Islington Council secured funding from the Mayor of London’s Good Growth fund (matched by £400k council funding) to deliver part of the proposed project, with the traders hub to be delivered once further funding is secured. The Council is exploring the potential to apply elements of the Chapel Market project to Whitecross Street Market in order to re-connect the Market with the local community and contribute to economic and social recovery from Covid-19. Work is also beginning to develop an inclusive economy markets strategy for the whole borough.
5.3 Offer opportunities and support to all current traders

To be inclusive, market improvement and redevelopment schemes should ensure all current traders are offered the opportunity and support to trade in the new market. Including current traders will help to ensure that they benefit from investment, that existing jobs and livelihoods are not damaged and that the market continues to serve the existing customer base after redevelopment. Operators offering opportunities to all current traders will also benefit from more positive engagement and involvement from traders and customers in shaping the proposals.

This issue can often be complex and challenging in practice, with the potential to generate division between market operators and traders. Market operators sometimes require traders to demonstrate the financial viability of their businesses, with traders unable to join the new market if their business is not proved to be sustainable. Market operators may also want to reduce the number of traders selling the same product lines. There is also often a desire to provide space for traders providing new product lines who might attract new customer groups.

For these reasons, amongst others, market operators and their consultants often require traders to re-apply to trade in the new market, satisfying a number of criteria or conditions. In general, criteria or conditions to trade in the new market should be as broad and inclusive as possible. Market operators should therefore assess and mitigate the potential negative impact of any necessary criteria and conditions on both traders and users. Operators may have no intention of any negative impact, but if the risks are not identified or mitigated, the effect can be to exclude certain trader and user groups. Particular care should be taken to assess and mitigate the potential impact on user groups for whom TRMs are particularly important, including equalities and other protected groups, for example people living on low incomes, older people, Black and Minoritised communities and migrants. If negative impacts are identified, market operators should amend the relevant criteria and conditions and/or provide training and support to afford all traders the opportunity to be included. Any traders who are ultimately unable to trade from the new or redeveloped market should be fully compensated and found alternative suitable and affordable premises.

**Warrington Borough Council** aimed to ensure as many traders as possible were included in the new temporary and permanent Warrington Market (see Section 5.1). Traders had to meet a minimum total rating against a set of basic criteria, focused mainly on compliance with trading and environmental health standards, rent arrears and customer complaints. No commodities were excluded from the temporary or the new market, but 10% of the total rating was based on whether or not the trader was selling a ‘desired commodity’. The Council provided feedback to any traders who did not meet the required total rating initially (including feedback from a ‘mystery shopper’). Traders were then given an opportunity to address any problems and re-apply. In the end, fewer than 10 traders did not make the move to the temporary market, several of whom in the end decided that the smaller units on offer in the temporary and new markets were not suitable for them. Traders received the compensation they were entitled to for the termination of their tenancy agreements under the Landlord and Tenant Act 1985. Fewer than five traders did not make the move from the temporary market to the new permanent market; in every case this was due to a change in personal circumstances for the trader, for example a change of career or moving to another country.

**Bradford Council** is developing a training package to support current and prospective market traders applying to trade in the new Darley Street Market (see Section 5.1). Current and prospective traders will be required to undertake a bespoke online training course developed for the Council by Bradford College. The training course will support and enable traders to meet the standards and requirements of the new market relating to, for example, business planning, e-commerce and sustainability. The Council is attempting to keep the cost of the training as low as possible for traders by recouping the cost of developing the course by licensing it for use by other local authorities. Existing traders who are ultimately unsuccessful will be helped by the Council to relocate elsewhere. While the Council has not made up-front commitments to include all current traders in the new Darley Street Market, these measures will help to make the application process more inclusive.
When **Newham Council** commissioned a series of studies into options for refurbishing and modernising **Queen’s Market** in 2021 (see Sections 5.1 and 5.2), it also made an up-front commitment to include all permanent licensed market traders (as long as they abide by the conditions of their license). The same commitment was not extended, however, to the small businesses leasing commercial units from the Council at the Market; rather the Council committed to finding commercial leaseholders alternative premises if they were displaced. While it is too early to assess the potential impact of these decisions on the options being explored through the commissioned studies, including all traders and commercial tenants is likely to be a key factor in determining whether the Council ultimately achieves its goal of ensuring Queen’s Market ‘will continue to serve the communities it does today. Its primary focus will be to remain a community market serving lower-income residents, and an ethnically diverse local population’.

### 5.4 Minimise disruption for existing traders

Another key element of inclusive market redevelopment is minimising and mitigating disruption for traders during the redevelopment process. Markets are delicate ecosystems which can be easily disturbed and damaged, even unintentionally. On-site refurbishment and improvement works can be noisy and off-putting for customers, resulting in reduced footfall and turnover for traders during lengthy construction periods. Moving location, even within the same market, can be costly and disruptive for traders, who have to fit out new units and update market materials, and for their customers, who have to re-learn how to navigate the new or improved market to find their usual traders. Moving traders more than once during the redevelopment process multiplies these costs and impacts. In some cases, the disruption and costs of redevelopment can threaten the viability of previously successful businesses and the market as a whole.

The goal of minimising disruption for existing traders should therefore be built into the planning and design of redevelopment schemes from an early stage. This can be achieved through phased redevelopment which minimises the number of moves traders need to make, provision of suitable temporary market facilities on-site or nearby, and funding and support for traders to assist with the costs of fit out, new marketing etc. Many market operators now have a good awareness of the need to minimise and mitigate disruption, having learnt from others’ experiences in recent years.

**Bradford Council** will not close the Oastler and Kirkgate markets until after the new **Darley Street Market** (see Section 5.1 and 5.3) opens. This means traders will only need to move once from the old markets to the new market, minimising the disruption and cost involved. As footfall is already declining in the old markets, the Council has offered existing traders the option to sign a new lease with 35% lower rents. Additionally, traders are able to claim up-front the compensation they will receive when their leases are terminated on the closure of the markets in the form of an additional rent reduction. Vacant units are also offered to existing stallholders at reduced rents (for example, at £5 instead of £20 or £25 per square foot). The Council has also committed to freeze service charges at 2016 levels. These measures help to reduce the financial burden on traders during the construction period and to keep the current markets as lively as possible until the new market is ready.

**Barnsley Council**’s wider £135m ‘Glass Works’ town centre development project required the existing indoor and outdoor **Barnsley Markets** to close as part of the construction process. The importance of markets to Barnsley’s local identity and the political commitment of the Council leadership to markets resulted in the Council investing £2m in a high-quality temporary indoor market. This investment was made in order to enable traders to keep trading during the three-year construction period, ensuring there was a market offer to take into the new indoor market once the Glass Works project was completed.
Warrington Borough Council’s temporary market operated for 1009 days until the new Warrington Market opened (see Sections 5.1 and 5.3 above). As the temporary market was surrounded by a construction site and had no passing trade, the Council organised many community events and activities to increase footfall. For example, the Market hosted a bring and buy sale in aid of Children in Need, a Hungarian market event and children’s activities. This programming also helped to retain traders and customers from the old Market whilst also attracting new traders and customers, strengthening the market before the move to its permanent location. The Council also experimented with occasional late night and Sunday opening at the temporary market. Although the Market’s poor location meant that these experiments were only really successful in the run-up to Christmas, they gave traders an opportunity to think through and try out the changes that they might make on moving to more extended opening hours at the new market. The temporary market won NABMA’s annual award for Best Small Indoor Market in 2019 and in 2022 the new Market won NABMA’s Britain’s Best Large Indoor Market award.
5.5 Ensure trader mix policies reflect community value

To ensure an inclusive redevelopment, local authorities can use ‘tenant mix’ policies\(^7\) in an innovative way, to be as certain as possible that in the new or refurbished market community value is not only retained but enhanced. Local authorities can align trader mix policies with other priorities across the council. This might include attracting and retaining traders whose offering is affordable, serves particular communities, and/or supports a market’s social functions. For instance, traders selling affordable fruit and vegetables, whose offering supports essential everyday provisioning as well as wide-ranging health and well-being outcomes for people living on low-incomes. It might also include traditional cafes serving a predominately older customer base who particularly value the affordable offering, warmth, seating and basic sociability they provide. Where market forces threaten these traditional affordable offerings, tenant mix policies combined with differential rent levels can offer some protection, ensuring a market continues to deliver community value to older people, people living on low incomes, migrants and Black and Minoritised communities. Market operators can also make use of the other ideas for enhancing community value outlined in this handbook, for example locating library or other council services in markets (see Section 3).

Ridley Road Market, Hackney (Hackney Council)

Hackney Council is committed to ensuring the street markets it operates meet the needs of the local community. Although Hackney has become one of London’s most expensive boroughs to live in, it is still home to many people living on low incomes. The Council’s Markets Service aims to ensure its markets cater to both low- and higher-income groups, as well as the ethnically diverse community. The Markets Service actively celebrate and promote Hackney’s street markets as affordable shopping locations\(^8\). At Broadway Market – a weekly street food and artisan market popular with locals and tourists with higher disposable income – the Council is working to increase the percentage of traders with an affordable offering to 50% in order to attract more local people on low incomes. At the time of writing, there are now two traders selling low-cost fruit and vegetables at Broadway Market. The team also aims to ensure traders on Hackney’s street markets are broadly representative of the local ethnically-diverse population. To inform this work, the team conducts regular trader surveys to assess the extent to which street markets serve and represent local low-income and ethnically diverse communities (see Section 5.7). This work will be particularly important in the case of Ridley Road Market, which currently provides affordable and specialist goods and services to Afro-Caribbean and Asian communities. Trader mix policies may help to ensure the Market retains this role as improvement works are carried out and large-scale housing and commercial development takes place in the immediate area, bringing a new higher-income population to the Market.
Brixton in South London is home to two street markets operated by Lambeth Council and three privately-owned and operated indoor markets, Reliance Arcade, Market Row and Brixton Village (formerly the Granville Arcade). All three indoor markets were listed by Heritage England in 2010 on account of their importance to the Afro-Caribbean communities who came to Britain following the Second World War, invited by the UK Government to address labour shortages (the Windrush Generation).\textsuperscript{81} The heritage listing prevented the demolition and redevelopment of Granville Arcade, and was proposed by Friends of Brixton Market as part of their wider campaign against the plans. While the heritage listing offered Brixton’s markets some protection against redevelopment, over the years their role and importance to Afro-Caribbean communities has been threatened by gentrification as the market offer has shifted towards a new, higher-income clientele. In 2020, residents, traders and supporters mounted a high-profile and successful campaign against the eviction of a popular and long-standing affordable grocery retailer from Market Row by Hondo Enterprises, a property company which purchased Market Row and Brixton Village in 2018.\textsuperscript{82} Hondo Enterprises was also the target of another partially-successful campaign against a 20-storey tower in Brixton in 2021.\textsuperscript{83}

Hondo Enterprises have attempted to respond to these criticisms and campaigns by looking to retain a balance between traditional traders serving lower-income Afro-Caribbean communities and new traders targeting a higher-income customer base.\textsuperscript{84} Rents are lower for traders selling fresh food than for traders selling other goods such as fabrics, and rents are higher still for cafes, restaurants and bars. Traders who have been in the markets for a long time also generally pay less rent than newer traders. These policies represent interesting innovations from a private operator facing intense local scrutiny from experienced campaigners in an area in which gentrification has been vigorously contested in recent years.\textsuperscript{85} In the absence of systematic research, however, it is difficult to assess whether differential rents have contributed to the retention of traditional traders in recent years. Neither is it possible to assess whether the ‘traditional’ and ‘new’ traders in Brixton’s Market effectively operate as parallel markets, each with a separate and distinct customer base, or whether their co-existence offers benefits to traditional or new traders through an expanded customer base. Moreover, concerns about gentrification remain and are actively voiced by various local groups. It will be important for other market operators interested in using differential rents to balance traditional and new traders to incorporate the monitoring of these issues to develop a more detailed understanding of their impact.

### 5.6 Collaborate with trader and user groups

Market operators will be better placed to pursue inclusive market improvement and redevelopment schemes if they engage and collaborate with market traders, users and other local groups. Traders and users have different perspectives and insights about TRMs, built through their own experience and knowledge, which will usually differ from those of market operators.\textsuperscript{86} Local community and small business groups may also have relevant connections and insights from their wider engagement and involvement in the area. To harness this knowledge and networks, market operators can meet regularly with market traders, users and other local groups, and invite them to join any relevant council markets fora (see Section 3.4). Where there has been a history of conflict over a market, market operators may need to take extra time and care to build trust and dialogue with traders, users and other groups, before exploring the need for any improvement or redevelopment plans.

Even well-intentioned and well-designed consultation and co-production processes can be complex and inaccessible for market traders, users and other local groups. Participating in these activities can be very time-consuming, making it difficult for traders and users already working long hours, juggling multiple commitments and/or living on low-incomes to participate. Market operators will therefore need to consider how to make activities as accessible as possible, including how to support and resource substantive involvement and collaboration.

Going further, market operators can offer traders, users and local groups opportunities to play a greater role in the new or improved market, helping to ensure improvement and redevelopment schemes involve and benefit existing traders, users and the local community. This collaborative approach involves sharing power and resources with traders, users and local groups, offering opportunities to take ownership and responsibility for delivering or managing specific elements of a project or programme. For example, a market traders association could design, own and manage new trader facilities. Alternatively, a local community group could design, own and manage a new events space. Market operators can also support traders, users or local groups that want to
explore the option of owning and managing a market themselves through a social enterprise, cooperative or community benefit society, a topic which is explored in a forthcoming Markets4People handbook. Some local authority markets teams already include a diversity of differently-operated markets, including community or privately-operated markets as well as local authority-operated markets. In any partnership, contract or lease, it is important to be clear which party is responsible for managing the market.

In Hackney, the Council undertook a year-long engagement with traders and residents to inform a £1.5m programme of improvements to Ridley Road Market, including green spaces and seating, new stalls, paving and brickwork, and free wi-fi. Information packs were sent to all residents of all local wards in Dalston, a series of engagement days were organised and meetings were held with local groups. This engagement formed part of a wider programme of regular engagement by the Markets Service. Groups have been set up in each local ward containing a market, including the relevant trader association, local ward councillors and other local groups, for example Hackney Living Streets. These ward groups meet regularly and are useful fora for the Markets Service to tackle issues in markets. For example, through the ward groups the Markets Service was able to work together with local community groups to reduce unsafe cycling through street markets. At the end of each year, the Markets Service invite representatives from all ward groups to attend an annual presentation, including a review of the previous year, updates on future plans, Q&A and informal networking. These activities are valued by the Markets Service because they foster dialogue and build relationships as part of a broader shift towards collaborative working. Ridley Road Market remains a conflicted site, however; some traders claim they are being pushed out of the Market and local campaign group Save Ridley Road Market continues to raise concerns about displacement and gentrification. The Markets Service reports that they will continue to address such concerns through regular engagement with traders and residents, citing the Council’s recent decision to take over Ridley Road Shopping Village, a major focus of campaigners’ attention.

Architectural designers Unit 38 used a co-design approach to shape improvement plans for Chapel Market, a street market operated by Islington Council, north London (see Section 5.2). The initial engagement included three workshops with local community organisations, activities at a market stall and individual interviews with market traders. In addition, Unit 38 identified and engaged with local community and business organisations in order to explore and foster their involvement and connection with the Market. These conversations not only produced ideas for improvements at Chapel Market, but also explored the potential for collaboration between the Council and community and business groups on some of these initiatives. For example, a workshop with young people involved in a local youth hub, the LIFT project, produced ideas for public murals, performing arts and training programmes linked to market trading, delivered in conjunction with LIFT. Likewise, conversations with a local community centre, St Luke’s, revealed the potential to build links with Chapel Market, for example joint programming of the new events space and promotion of new opportunities for St Luke’s users. A pilot music event was also organised in collaboration with the nearby Copenhagen Youth Project, to test interest in public performance at Chapel Market. By embedding these conversations and activities within the design process itself, the Council and its design team were able to identify and develop a number of potential collaborations which could be pursued alongside the physical improvements to the Market.
5.7 Monitor the inclusivity of redevelopment schemes

Market operators aiming to achieve inclusive market improvement and redevelopment projects need to develop measures of success against which to monitor their performance. The main elements of inclusive market redevelopment outlined in this section provide the basis for a ‘core’ set of indicators (Table 3) which should be relevant to most improvement and redevelopment schemes. In addition, market operators can use the tools for understanding the community value of TRMs described in Section 2 to define a set of indicators to measure the wider community benefit resulting from a market improvement or redevelopment scheme. Each development scheme will require a slightly different approach, depending on the scheme, the market and the community. The development and monitoring of indicators should be a collaborative process, involving market traders, users and other local groups as well as market operators themselves. Once a specific improvement or redevelopment scheme is delivered, market operators can incorporate community benefit indicators into the performance monitoring for the markets service as a whole, as discussed in Section 3.
Hackney Council’s Market Service is committed to ensuring Hackney markets serve and are representative of the local community, in particular low-income, Black and Minoritised communities. To assess their performance on this goal, the Markets Service conducts regular basket spend surveys to compare the affordability of the market offer. They also conduct regular trader surveys to establish the proportion of traders providing an affordable offering for people on low-incomes and the ethnic mix of traders. The Markets Service compare this information to ward level demographic data for each market in order to establish the extent to which it is representative and serving the needs of the local community. This measure of success will be used to inform and monitor the Council’s efforts to support, sustain and further develop the role of Hackney markets in serving local low-income, Black and Minoritised communities. At Broadway Market, for example, the Council is working to increase the percentage of traders with an affordable offering to 50% in order to attract more local people on low incomes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Secure long-term community benefits from redevelopment, rather than a short-term financial return</strong></td>
<td>Surplus (if there is one) retained (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>External funding secured (£)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Annual maintenance budget (£)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average rents per sqm (£)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Plus community value measures (see Section 2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Pursue a programme of regular incremental improvement that enhances community value</strong></td>
<td>Traders satisfied or very satisfied with the market environment (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Users satisfied or very satisfied with the market environment (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Plus community value measures (see Section 2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Ensure all traders have the opportunity and support to take up a place in the new market</strong></td>
<td>Traders from the old market trading in the new market (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Traders receiving training/support as part of application process (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Traders from the old market who consider the new market a significant improvement (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Minimise disruption during the redevelopment process</strong></td>
<td>Traders moved during redevelopment (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Duration of temporary market (if there is one) (months).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Traders receiving financial support (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Traders receiving other forms of support (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Ensure trader mix policies for redeveloped markets reflect community value</strong></td>
<td>Traders with an affordable offering in the new market (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Users on low incomes that consider the new market affordable (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. Work in collaboration with market trader, user and local groups</strong></td>
<td>Meetings with traders, users and other groups (#)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Representation of traders, users and other groups on market fora (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Collaborative projects initiated (#)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Funding awarded to trader, user and other groups (£)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix

Selected Markets4People interviews (out of a broader group of 50), 2018-2019
Alexandra Rose Charity
Bradford Council
Borough Market, London
Bury Council
Levenshulme Market, Greater Manchester
Newham Council (various)
Newcastle City Council
Newcastle United Football Club Supporters
Foodbank

Handbook workshop with market operators,
February 2021
Barnsley Council
Bradford Council
Bury Council
East Cambs Trading Company
Freeman Street Market, Grimsby
Greig and Stephenson architects
Hull City Council
Naturally North Coast and Glens, Northern Ireland

Follow-up discussions with case studies
Alexandra Rose Charity, August 2021
Barnsley Council, August 2021
Bradford Council, February and September 2021
Bury Council, September 2021
Calderdale Council, September 2021
East Cambs Trading Company, July 2021
Freeman Street Market, Grimsby, July 2021
Greig and Stephenson architects, September 2021
Hackney Council, September 2021
Hondo Enterprises, April 2021
Islington Council, October 2021
Kirklees Council, September 2021
Leeds City Council, July and August 2021
Mendip Borough District Council, September 2021
Newcastle City Council, August 2021
Newham, August 2021
Sheffield City Council, September 2021
University of Huddersfield, August 2021
Warrington Borough Council, March and September 2021
Wyre Borough Council, October 2021
References

1. https://trmcommunityvalue.leeds.ac.uk/


18 Newham Council later secured a further £1.9m from HM Government’s Levelling Up Fund to support these projects (Personal communication (2022). Email to the research team from Newham Council Regeneration team. 19 January).

19 Mayor of London (2019).

20 Newham Council (not dated).


30 Three of Haris Ahmed’s poems are published on the Markets4People website at https://trmcommunityvalue.leeds.ac.uk/poetry-by-haris-ahmed/.


35 https://twitter.com/AlexRoseCharity/status/1447486720333739796.


Calderdale Council (nd). Report on the Apprentice. Shared with the research team.

Personal communication (2022). Email to the research team from NMTF. 17 January.

Bailey, R. (nd) Temporary Contemporary. Script from presentation. Shared with the research team.

Bailey (nd).


For more information about NMTF’s JobCentre Plus scheme, see https://www.nmtf.co.uk/campaigns/work-experience/.

For more information about NMTF’s Young Trader scheme, see https://www.nmtf.co.uk/campaigns/young-traders-market/ For more information about the Teenage Market initiative, see https://theteenagemarket.co.uk/.


Newcastle West End Foodbank (2017a).

Alexandra Rose Charity. (not dated). Where we work. https://www.alexandrarose.org.uk/rose-vouchers/where-we-work.


Personal communication (2021). Email to the research team from Critchill School Careers and Working Futures Lead. 21 October.

González and Waley (2013); González and Dawson (2015); Seale (2016); González (2018); Taylor, González and Northrop (2019).


London Borough of Newham. (2021a, p7).


Bury Council (2021).


Unit 38 (2020).

NEF Consulting (2020).


London Borough of Newham (2021a).

London Borough of Newham (2021a, p5).
Tenant mix (or ‘balance of trades’) policies are a means of managing the range of goods and services on sale in a market, through encouraging and restricting new applications from traders in certain commodities. NABMA. (not dated). Tenant Mix Policy for Markets. Shared with the research team.

See, for example, Hackney Council’s video comparing prices in Ridley Road Market to supermarket prices: https://hackney.gov.uk/ridley-road-market.


Personal communication. (2022). Email to the research team from Hackney Council Markets Service. 19 January.